Correction to "D-Stability and Delay-Independent Stability of Homogeneous Cooperative Systems"

Vahid Samadi Bokharaie, Oliver Mason, and Mark Verwoerd

***Abstract*—We correct some errors in the statements and proofs presented in Section V of the above mentioned manuscript.**

In the recent paper [1], the results of Section V are incorrect as stated. In this brief note, we first present an example to show that the statement of Theorem 5.1 in [1] is incorrect and then state a corrected version of this result under an additional technical assumption on the vector field f.

Example 1: Consider the 2-D cooperative system given by

$$\dot{x} = f(x_1, x_2) = \begin{pmatrix} -\frac{x_1}{1+x_1} + x_2 \\ -\frac{x_2}{1+x_2} \end{pmatrix}.$$

Using a similar argument as employed in Example 3.19 of [2], it can be shown that the origin is a globally asymptotically stable equilibrium of this system. However, it is clear that choosing $a = (1, 2)$, there can be no vector $v \geq a$ with $f(v) \ll 0$.

The proof of Theorem 5.1 in [1] implicitly assumes that for any $a \in \mathbb{R}^n_+$, both of the sets

$$\begin{aligned} \Omega_1 &:= \{x \geq a : f_1(x) < 0\} \\ \Omega_2 &:= \{x \geq a : f_2(x) < 0\} \end{aligned} \tag{1}$$

are *non-empty*. In general, this will not be the case as is clear from the above example.

In order for the conclusion of Theorem 5.1 in [1] to hold, it is necessary to impose some additional assumption on the vector field f.

Assumption A:

(i) For any $x_1 \in \mathbb{R}_+$, there exists some K_{x_1} and $\epsilon_{x_1} > 0$ such that $(\partial f_2/\partial x_2)(x_1, t) \leq -\epsilon_{x_1}$ for all $t \geq K_{x_1}$.

(ii) For any $x_2 \in \mathbb{R}_+$, there exists some K_{x_2} and $\epsilon_{x_2} > 0$ such that $(\partial f_1/\partial x_1)(t, x_2) \leq -\epsilon_{x_2}$ for all $t \geq K_{x_2}$.

In the following result, which is a correction of Theorem 5.1 in [1], f is required to satisfy the same conditions as in Section V of [1] as well as Assumption A above.

Theorem 5.1: Assume that the system $\dot{x}(t) = f(x(t))$ has a GAS equilibrium at the origin. Then given any $a \in \mathbb{R}^2_+$, there exists $v \geq a$ with $f(v) \ll 0$.

Proof: If there exist $u \geq a$ and $w \geq a$ with $f_1(u) < 0$ and $f_2(w) < 0$ then the sets Ω_1, Ω_2 in (1) are both non-empty and the argument presented in Theorem 5.1 of [1] implies the existence of a $v \geq a$ with $f(v) \ll 0$. We now prove that, provided Assumption A is satisfied, these sets are both non-empty.

We shall show that there exists $u \geq a$ with $f_1(u) < 0$. (The proof that there is a $w \geq a$ with $f_2(w) < 0$ is identical.) By Assumption A, there exist some constants K, $\epsilon > 0$ such that

$$\frac{\partial f_1}{\partial x_1}(t, a_2) < -\epsilon$$

for all $t \geq K$. For $t \geq K$, we have

$$\begin{aligned} f_1(t, a_2) &= f_1(K, a_2) + \int_K^t \frac{\partial f_1}{\partial x_1}(s, a_2) ds \\ &\leq f_1(K, a_2) - \epsilon(t - K). \end{aligned}$$

This immediately implies that for

$$t > K + \frac{f_1(K, a_2)}{\epsilon}$$

we must have $f_1(t, a_2) < 0$. This completes the proof.

Provided the vector field f satisfies the additional Assumption A and g is non-decreasing, the other results of Section V of [1] are correct as stated.

References

[1] V. S. Bokharaie, O. Mason, and M. Verwoerd, "Stability properties of equilibria of classes of cooperative systems," *IEEE Trans. Autom. Control*, vol. 55, no. 12, pp. 2882–2885, Dec. 2010.

[2] B. S. Ruffer, C. M. Kellett, and S. R. Weller, "Connection between cooperative positive systems and integral input-to-state stability of large-scale systems," *Automatica*, vol. 46, no. 6, pp. 1019–1027, 2010.

Manuscript received January 13, 2011; accepted February 21, 2011. Date of current version June 08, 2011. Recommended by Associate Editor L. Marconi.

The authors are with the Hamilton Institute, National University of Ireland, Maynooth, Ireland (e-mail: vahid.bokharaie@nuim.ie; oliver.mason@nuim.ie; mark.verwoerd@nuim.ie).

Digital Object Identifier 10.1109/TAC.2011.2122790